

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

WILDCAT RETRO BRANDS, LLC, a
California Limited Liability Company;

Plaintiff,

v.

MARC HERMAN, an individual; BART
SILBERMAN, an individual; and
DOUBLE HEADER LICENSING, LLC,
a California Limited Liability Company;
and DOES 1-100, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 2:18-cv-07833-JAK (ASx)

PROTECTIVE ORDER

1 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
3 proprietary or private information for which special protection from public disclosure
4 and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.
5 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the
6 following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does
7 not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the
8 protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited
9 information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable
10 legal principles.

11 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

12 This action involves allegations of unfair competition among multiple
13 businesses, and is likely to involve putative trade secrets, customer and pricing lists
14 and other valuable research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or
15 proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and from
16 use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such
17 confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things,
18 confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential
19 business practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial
20 information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties),
21 information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged
22 or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case
23 decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to
24 facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials,
25 to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to
26 ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in
27 preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the
28 litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is

1 justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be
2 designated as confidential for tactical reasons, and that nothing be so designated
3 without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public
4 manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this
5 case.

6 C. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF PROCEDURE FOR FILING UNDER
7 SEAL

8 The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this
9 Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under
10 seal; Local Civil Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the
11 standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file
12 material under seal.

13 There is a strong presumption that the public has a right of access to judicial
14 proceedings and records in civil cases. In connection with non-dispositive motions,
15 good cause must be shown to support a filing under seal. *See Kamakana v. City and*
16 *County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1176 (9th Cir. 2006), *Phillips v. Gen. Motors*
17 *Corp.*, 307 F.3d 1206, 1210-11 (9th Cir. 2002), *Makar-Welbon v. Sony Electronics, Inc.*,
18 187 F.R.D. 576, 577 (E.D. Wis. 1999) (even stipulated protective orders require good
19 cause showing), and a specific showing of good cause or compelling reasons with
20 proper evidentiary support and legal justification, must be made with respect to
21 Protected Material that a party seeks to file under seal. The parties' mere designation
22 of Disclosure or Discovery Material as CONFIDENTIAL does not— without the
23 submission of competent evidence by declaration, establishing that the material sought
24 to be filed under seal qualifies as confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable—
25 constitute good cause.

26 Further, if a party requests sealing related to a dispositive motion or trial, then
27 compelling reasons, not only good cause, for the sealing must be shown, and the relief
28 sought shall be narrowly tailored to serve the specific interest to be protected. *See*

1 *Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass’n.*, 605 F.3d 665, 677-79 (9th Cir. 2010). For each
2 item or type of information, document, or thing sought to be filed or introduced under
3 seal in connection with a dispositive motion or trial, the party seeking protection must
4 articulate compelling reasons, supported by specific facts and legal justification, for
5 the requested sealing order. Again, competent evidence supporting the application to
6 file documents under seal must be provided by declaration.

7 Any document that is not confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable in its
8 entirety will not be filed under seal if the confidential portions can be redacted. If
9 documents can be redacted, then a redacted version for public viewing, omitting only
10 the confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable portions of the document, shall
11 be filed. Any application that seeks to file documents under seal in their entirety
12 should include an explanation of why redaction is not feasible.

13 2. DEFINITIONS

14 2.1 Action: This pending U.S. District Court lawsuit, Wildcat Retro Brands,
15 LLC v. Marc Herman, et al., Case No. 2:18-cv-07833-JAK-AS.

16 2.2 Challenging Party: A Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
17 of information or items under this Order.

18 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: Information (regardless of
19 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection
20 under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good
21 Cause Statement.

22 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
23 support staff).

24 2.5 Designating Party: A Party or Non-Party that designates information or
25 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
26 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

27 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: All items or information, regardless of
28 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,

1 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
2 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

3 2.7 Expert: A person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
4 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an
5 expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

6 2.8 House Counsel: Attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
7 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
8 counsel.

9 2.9 Non-Party: Any natural person, partnership, corporation, association or
10 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

11 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: Attorneys who are not employees of a party
12 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
13 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm that has
14 appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

15 2.11 Party: Any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
16 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
17 support staffs).

18 2.12 Producing Party: A Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
19 Discovery Material in this Action.

20 2.13 Professional Vendors: Persons or entities that provide litigation support
21 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
22 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
23 and their employees and subcontractors.

24 2.14 Protected Material: Any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
25 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

26 2.15 Receiving Party: A Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
27 from a Producing Party.
28

1 3. SCOPE

2 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
3 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted
4 from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of
5 Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties
6 or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

7 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial
8 judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

9 4. DURATION

10 Once a case proceeds to trial, information that was designated as
11 CONFIDENTIAL or maintained pursuant to this protective order used or introduced
12 as an exhibit at trial becomes public and will be presumptively available to all
13 members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by
14 specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance of
15 the trial. *See Kamakana*, 447 F.3d at 1180-81 (distinguishing “good cause” showing
16 for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons” standard
17 when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the terms of
18 this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

19 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

20 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

21 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this
22 Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies
23 under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection
24 only those parts of material, documents, items or oral or written communications that
25 qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items or communications for
26 which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this
27 Order.

1 Mass, indiscriminate or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
2 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
3 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
4 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party
5 to sanctions.

6 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
7 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
8 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

9 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
10 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
11 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
12 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
13 produced.

14 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

15 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
16 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
17 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
18 "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that
19 contains protected material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for
20 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s)
21 (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

22 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
23 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
24 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
25 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
26 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents
27 it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,
28 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing

1 the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL
2 legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion of the material
3 on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the
4 protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

5 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party
6 identifies the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
7 deposition all protected testimony.

8 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and
9 for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
10 exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend
11 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
12 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
13 portion(s).

14 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
15 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
16 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
17 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
18 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
19 Order.

20 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

21 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
22 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
23 Scheduling Order.

24 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
25 resolution process under Local Rule 37-1 et seq.

26 6.3 Joint Stipulation. Any challenge submitted to the Court shall be via a
27 joint stipulation pursuant to Local Rule 37-2.
28

1 6.4 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
2 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose
3 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may
4 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived
5 or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the
6 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing
7 Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

8 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

9 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
10 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
11 Action only for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle this Action. Such
12 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
13 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving
14 Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

15 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
16 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
17 authorized under this Order.

18 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless
19 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
20 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL"
21 only to:

22 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
23 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
24 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

25 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
26 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;
27
28

1 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
2 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
3 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

4 (d) the court and its personnel;

5 (e) court reporters and their staff;

6 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
7 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
8 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

9 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
10 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

11 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
12 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
13 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will
14 not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
15 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed
16 by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition
17 testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately
18 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted
19 under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

20 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
21 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

22 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN
23 OTHER LITIGATION

24 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
25 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
26 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

27 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification
28 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

1 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
2 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena
3 or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of
4 this Stipulated Protective Order; and

5 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
6 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

7 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
8 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
9 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
10 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
11 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
12 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
13 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to
14 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

15 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
16 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

17 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
18 Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
19 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
20 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
21 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

22 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
23 produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
24 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s
25 confidential information, then the Party shall:

26 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
27 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement
28 with a Non-Party;

1 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
2 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
3 specific description of the information requested; and

4 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
5 Non-Party, if requested.

6 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within
7 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
8 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
9 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall
10 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
11 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
12 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense
13 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

14 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

15 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
16 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
17 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
18 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
19 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
20 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
21 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and
22 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

23 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
24 PROTECTED MATERIAL

25 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
26 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
27 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
28 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure

1 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
2 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
3 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
4 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
5 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to
6 the court.

7 12. MISCELLANEOUS

8 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
9 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

10 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
11 Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
12 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
13 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
14 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

15 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
16 Protected Material must comply with Local Civil Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
17 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
18 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
19 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in
20 the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

21 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

22 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
23 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
24 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this
25 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
26 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
27 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
28 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same

1 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
2 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
3 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
4 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
5 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
6 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
7 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
8 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
9 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
10 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
11 Section 4 (DURATION).

12 14. VIOLATION

13 Any violation of this Order may be punished by appropriate measures
14 including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.
15

16 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
17

18 All signatories listed, and on whose behalf the filing is submitted, including
19 those below, concur in the filing's content and have authorized the filing.
20

21 **K&L GATES LLP**

22 Dated: June 7, 2019

By: /s/ Saman M. Rejali

23 Christopher J. Kondon
24 Saman M. Rejali
25 Zachary T. Timm

26 Attorneys for Plaintiff Wildcat Retro
27 Brands, LLC
28

R2 LAW GROUP, LLP

Dated: June 7, 2019

By: /s/ Robin McConnell
Robin McConnell

Attorneys for Marc Herman, and
WSFI, Incorporated

**LAW OFFICES OF A. SCOTT
BROWN**

Dated: June 7, 2019

By: /s/ A. Scott Brown
A. Scott Brown

Attorneys for Bart Silberman, Matt
Lovenduski, and Double Header
Licensing, LLC

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

Date: June 12, 2019

/ s /
Honorable Alka Sagar
United States Magistrate Judge

1 EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3 I, _____ [print or type full name], of
4 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury
5 that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was
6 issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on
7 [date] in the case of **Wildcat Retro Brands, LLC v. Marc Herman, et al., U.S.D.C.**
8 **Case No. 2:18-cv-07833 JAK (ASx).** I agree to comply with and to be bound by all
9 the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that
10 failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of
11 contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information
12 or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except
13 in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order. I further agree to submit to the
14 jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Central District of California for
15 enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement
16 proceedings occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint
17 _____ [print or type full name] of
18 _____ [print or type full address and telephone
19 number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or
20 any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

21
22 Date: _____

23 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

24 Printed name: _____

25 Signature: _____
26
27
28